

Non-majority Media Between Diversity and Equality: An Analysis on the Turkish-Language Broadcasting in North Macedonia

Çeşitlilik ve Eşitlik Arasında Azınlık Medyası: Kuzey Makedonya'da Türkçe Dilinde Yayınlar Üzerine Bir Analiz

Abdullah Sencer Gözübenli¹, Nazli Tekeshanoska²

¹Ph.D Student, Ss. Cyril and Methodius University in Skopje, Institute for Sociological, Political and Juridical Research, Skopje, Republic of North Macedonia

²Masters Student, International Balkan University, Skopje, Republic of North Macedonia

¹a.sencer.g@gmail.com, ²naz.tekke@gmail.com

Corresponding author: a.sencer.g@gmail.com



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License

Abstract

The use of minority language in the broadcast media plays an important part in preserving the identity, culture and history of ethno-linguistic minority. The right of access of ethno-linguistic minorities to the media and equitable representation of communities in mass media in multi-ethnic countries are the human rights which are still evolving both in law and in practice. In this context, the rights of minority groups to freedom of expression and information with minority-language related broadcasting are protected by international treaties in the Europe, i.e., the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages etc. One of those countries that signed those conventions mentioned above and one of candidate countries for the EU membership, Republic of North Macedonia is populated by a substantial number of the members of national minorities. The recognition of the media rights of ethnic communities in the Republic of North Macedonia is based on the provisions of the Constitution of Republic of North Macedonia and various laws on free access to information. This comparative study aims to take a comprehensive look at the equitable representation of ethnic communities representing under 20% of total population in the Republic of North Macedonia, and examines the presence of Turkish language -that is spoken by nearly 4% of the population in the country according to the latest census of 2002- in both audio and audiovisual media.

Key words: North Macedonia; Access to media; Minority rights; Minority-language broadcasting; Ethno-linguistic minority

Özet

Medyada azınlık dilinin kullanılması etno-dilsel azınlığın kimliğini, kültürünü ve tarihini korumada önemli bir rol oynamaktadır. Etno-dilsel azınlıkların medyaya erişim hakkı ve çok etnikli ülkelerde kitle iletişim araçlarında toplulukların eşit şekilde temsil edilmesi, hem hukukta hem de uygulamada hala gelişen temel insan haklarıdır. Bu bağlamda, azınlık gruplarının ifade ve bilgi alma özgürlüğü ile azınlıkların kendi dillerinde yayın yapma hakları, Avrupa'daki uluslararası anlaşmalar, (Ulusal Azınlıkların Korunması için Çerçeve Sözleşme, Bölgesel veya Azınlık Dilleri için Avrupa Şartları vb.) ile korunmaktadır. Yukarıda belirtilen sözleşmeleri imzalayan ülkelerden biri ve aynı zamanda AB üyeliğine aday ülkelerden biri olan Kuzey Makedonya Cumhuriyeti'nin nüfusunun önemli bir kısmı ulusal azınlıklardan müteşekkildir. Kuzey Makedonya Cumhuriyeti'ndeki etnik toplulukların medya haklarının tanınması, Kuzey Makedonya Cumhuriyeti Anayasası hükümlerine ve bilgiye serbest erişim konusundaki çeşitli yasalara

dayanmaktadır. Bu karşılaştırmalı çalışma, Kuzey Makedonya Cumhuriyeti'nde toplam nüfusun % 20'sinden az olan etnik toplulukların hakça temsili kapsamlı bir şekilde incelemeyi amaçlamakta ve ülkedeki nüfusun yaklaşık % 4'ü tarafından konuşulan Türk dilinin (2002 yılında yapılan son nüfus sayımına göre) hem görsel-işitsel hem işitsel medyadaki varlığını incelemektedir..

Anahtar Kelimeler: Kuzey Makedonya; Medyaya erişim; Azınlık hakları; Azınlık dili yayını; Etno-dilsel azınlık.

INTRODUCTION

Radio is more than a music box and TV is more than just another device, of course more technologic one with visual content. Today, the language in audio and audiovisual media is the primary form of communication with its contemporary objective of giving an excessive exposure to the mass audience about what is right or wrong in social issues. (Kalehsar & Andarab, 2012) When people are learning “what is right and wrong” and “what is acceptable or unacceptable” often under the media’s lens or microphone, access to media is particularly important. Especially in multicultural societies, access to the media is often the choice of language, including choosing freedom of the form of expression. Starting point of our hypothesis is another hypothesis on this issue which says “to have an identity means to be able to express that identity through the medium of one’s choice.” (Darbishire, 1999) The information given in the general perspective of this paper remained between diversity and equality as well as between the concepts of identity, language and minority.

Languages are fundamental characteristics of the identities of individuals. Language provides the free expression and free communication to an individual as a member of society or community, although these features are of fundamental importance for the functioning of a democratic society, but in many cases they become a problem in the public administration. The recognition of the right of each person belonging to a national minorities to use his or her language freely is necessary in a democratic society as mentioned in the Article 10 of European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR). There are a large number of language-related regulations (both national and

international) that affect the shape of the broadcasting media which is the scope of this paper. Article 1 of the most fundamental human rights instrument, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, is the basic concept of all international standards relating to human rights and freedoms that states “all human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights”. All other international instruments related to human rights including minority rights have been built on this base. In European context, International standards dealing specifically with access to the media for minorities have been elaborated in following international instruments; Council of Europe’s Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (hereinafter referred to as FCNM) and European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (ECRML) and Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe’s (OSCE) Guidelines on the use of Minority Languages in the Broadcast Media and Document of the Copenhagen Meeting of the Conference on the Human Dimension. In international context, there is one instrument that dealing specifically with access to the media for minorities called International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) adopted by the UN General Assembly. In this paper, We used priorities and objectives in the scope of minority-language related broadcasting identified in the FCNM as the basis for comparative analysis.

As one of the most ethnically diverse countries in Europe, the Republic of North Macedonia where its people expressed their support in favour of giving up their country’s name for Macedonia’s possible entrance into NATO and the EU should respect European Treaties mentioned above. (Gözübenli & Tekeshanoska, 2018) In addition to the fact that all minority groups in the country are ethno-linguistic communities, the minority definition in the

country differs from other multi-ethnic countries in the region. Hence, the terms we use to refer to minorities in this paper differ from each other. After the Ohrid Framework Agreement (OFA) that ended the 2001 security crisis between Albanian rebels and Macedonian security forces with its provisions on community rights on local and national level, terms used to describe the ethnic communities divided into two separate categories: the group represented more than 20% of the population in Republic of North Macedonia which describes Albanian community (that constitute 25,2% of the population) and non-majority communities which describes the all communities that are less than 20% of the population in Republic of North Macedonia according to the last census in 2002, namely Turks, Roma, Serbs, Bosniaks and Vlachs.

There are only two main strategy papers on the right of access of ethno-linguistic minorities to the media and equitable representation of communities in mass media in the Republic of North Macedonia, namely Analysis of the Right to Use the Language, the Right to Receive Information in Community Language through Electronic and Print Media and the Right to Use Symbols for the Beneficiaries of Communities that are Smaller than 20% in the Republic Of Macedonia (2017) and the Analysis Concerning the Rights and Media Reporting about Ethnic Communities in Republic of Macedonia (2013) that were conducted by the Agency for Community Rights Realization of Republic of North Macedonia. In this paper, we find very important to analyze the rights and implementation practices of rights for Turks in North Macedonia, the largest non-majority community less than 20% of population in the one of the most ethnically diverse countries in Europe.

Comparative analysis in this case study was conducted based on the priorities in the scope of minority-language related broadcasting identified in the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, compared to comments from the Fourth Opinion on “the

former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”, adopted on 24 February 2016 published by the Council of Europe Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities with observations and field research of authors and a strategic report entitled Analysis concerning the rights and media reporting about ethnic communities in Republic of Macedonia conducted by the Agency for Community Rights Realization of Republic of North Macedonia in 2017.

AN OVERVIEW OF NON-MAJORITY COMMUNITY IN THE REPUBLIC OF NORTH MACEDONIA

The Republic of North Macedonia is a multi-ethnic and multi-confessional country between nation- building and so-called EU Member-state-building processes, with a substantial minority population that is around %36. According to the latest data from the State Statistical Office of the Republic of North Macedonia (SSO) the country is ethnically diverse, with Macedonian 64,2%, Albanian 25,2%, Turks 3,9%, Roma 2,7%, Serbs 1,8%, Bosniaks 0,8%, Vlachs (Aromanians) 0,5% and others 2.2%. (Државен завод за статистика на Република Македонија, 2005) In the late 1990s and the beginning of 2000s, inter-ethnic violence has jeopardized peaceful coexistence between ethnic Macedonians and Albanians. In the first decade of its independence the country witnessed increasing mobilization and mounting injustices of the non-majority community in the country, related to their political status and differences between the non-Macedonian community and the Macedonian majority about the nature of the state and the representation of the ethnic groups in it. A decade after its independence, the security crisis in the first half of 2001 brought the country to the brink of a civil war. A couple of months after the beginning of the security crisis, the Ohrid Framework Agreement (hereinafter referred to as OFA) signed on August, 13rd, 2001 to ensure the proper functioning of institutions and the integration of

ethnic communities with minority rights. The signing of the OFA ended country's armed conflict between Albanian rebels and Macedonian security forces and power-sharing system in the country was redesigned in an atmosphere of respect for values and principles of human rights. The country is today considered to be a stabilized post-conflict. (Gözübenli, 2016)

Language rights of Ethno-linguistic Communities in the Republic of North Macedonia

The OFA includes termination of inter-ethnic violence by providing rights to the ethnic communities with preserving the unitary character of North Macedonia and indicates that, civil and political rights of the Albanian and other non-majority communities are assured as well as their equal treatment based on the equitable representation principle with the citizens from Macedonian majority. Despite the fact that the subjects of OFA are the parties of the security crisis 2001 in reality (Albanian minority and Macedonian majority), the official use of the languages of non-majority communities in the country was effectively implemented after this framework agreement. (See. Table 1)

The recognition of the rights of the ethnic communities in the Republic of North Macedonia is based on the provisions of Article 16 of the Constitution of the Republic of North Macedonia since its independence in 1991. In more detail, with this article, freedom of speech, freedom of access to public communication tools and mass media, as well as the right of establishment of media organizations of the non-majority communities, are guaranteed. Following the signing of the OFA in 2001, with the amendments adopted in the Constitution, freedom expression of the members of non-majority communities, the right to the protection and development of their communities' identities and the right to use their own community symbols have been strongly guaranteed and reaffirmed.

The official use of languages that is spoken by at least and/or under 20% of the citizens was regulated by several laws after the OFA i.e. Fifth Amendment of the Constitution, the Law on the Use of Languages namely, Law on languages spoken by at least 20% of the citizens of the Republic of North Macedonia and local governments, that was adopted in 2008 (renewed in 2018) and Law on promotion and protection of members of communities that are less than 20% of the population in Republic of North Macedonia that was adopted in the same year. According to Fifth Amendment of the Constitution of Republic of North Macedonia dated 20.11.2001, "official language is Macedonian and its Cyrillic alphabet, and in the areas where 20% of the population speaks the non-majority language, the language and alphabet used by at least 20 % of the population is an official language in addition to Macedonian language and the Cyrillic alphabet in local level." (Republic of Macedonia, 1991; Loskovska, 2017) Law on the Use of Languages was renewed in 2018 after harsh debates in the North Macedonian Parliament. The renewed version of the law foresees that official languages of all state bodies in North Macedonia, i.e central institutions, public enterprises, agencies, directorates, institutions, commissions, legal entities etc. will be the language used by 20% of the citizens of North Macedonia and its alphabet in addition to Macedonian language and its alphabet. The Law on promotion and protection of members of communities that are less than 20% of the population in Republic of North Macedonia regulates the rights of community members on the use of language in accordance with the principle of equitable representation of community members. (Republic of Macedonia, 2008) Today, there are 15 multi-ethnic municipalities out of 80, that have at least one official non-majority language. The table below shows the implementation of the use of linguistic rights of non-majority communities in the Republic of North Macedonia in local level.

Table 1. List of municipalities which have communities less than 20% and official languages. (Languages with bold font are the languages of non-majority communities)

Municipality	Official Languages
Kumanovo	Macedonian, Albanian, Serbian and Romani
Mavrovo and Rostuša	Macedonian and Turkish
Staro Nagoričane	Macedonian and Serbian
Vraneštica	Macedonian and Turkish
Šuto Orizari	Macedonian and Romani
Centar Župa	Macedonian and Turkish
Plasnica	Macedonian and Turkish
Gostivar	Macedonian, Albanian and Turkish
Vrapčište	Macedonian, Albanian and Turkish
Čučer-Sandevo	Macedonian, Albanian and Serbian
Kruševo	Macedonia, Albanian and Aromanian
Kičevo	Macedonian, Albanian and Turkish
Dolneni	Macedonian, Albanian, Turkish and Bosnian
Studeničani	Macedonian, Albanian, Turkish and Bosnian
Čair	Macedonian, Albanian and Turkish

Source: Агенцијата за остварување на правата на заедниците, (2017), “Анализа на правото на употреба на јазикот, право на информирање на свој јазик преку електронските и печатените медиуми и право на употреба на симболи на припадниците на заедниците кои се помалку од 20 % во Република Македонија”. (2017: 5)

Rights of the Ethno-linguistic Communities in the Media and Non-majority-language Broadcasting in Republic of North Macedonia

In the Republic of North Macedonia, the first law, namely Law on Broadcasting Activity, that legally guaranteed the rights of the ethnic communities in the media was adopted in 1997. According to this law, public broadcasting service namely the Macedonian Radio Television (MRT) was obligated to broadcast programs besides in Macedonian, also in the languages of the other ethnic communities. (Tuneva, 2013) In accordance with this law, ethnic communities are allowed to establish private audio and audiovisual services that broadcast programs in their language. (Republic of Macedonia, 1997) We should note that during the preparation of this law, there were several public radio and TV stations in multi-ethnic cities and regions in the country. Despite the fact that most of these radio and TV stations were closed due to the unsuccessful privatization procedure, in the period of 1991-1997, these public stations had right to broadcast in the languages of ethnic communities. But there were no rights that guaranteed these rights until 1997.

After the OFA, new Law on Broadcasting Activity was adopted in 2005 and with the renewed law, the rights of the ethnic communities in the media are reaffirmed and expanded. Main objectives of the provisions in Articles 2, 68, 74, 82, 83, 101, 104, 117, 120, 121 and 124 of the renewed law are to ensure the freedom of expression in the broadcasting activity, promotion, preservation and protection of the cultural and national identity of all citizens which are constituent part of the society. (Republic of Macedonia, 2005) Furthermore, there are several concrete obligations for public and private broadcasting services mentioned in the Law. For example, according to Article 124 of the law, the programs of the public broadcasting service MRT must satisfy requirements which are important for the cultivation of the cultural

identity of ethnic communities and it is obligated to broadcast at least 40% in the languages of the non-majority communities. For private broadcasting services which have license for broadcasting aimed for the members of ethnic communities are obligated to fully broadcast in the language of the community and to broadcast at least 30% of its programs which is originally produced in the language of the ethnic community and at least 30% vocal-instrumental music in that language, according to Articles 74/82. (Агенцијата за остварување на правата на заедниците, 2017)

Present Facts on the Non-majority-language Broadcasting in Republic of North Macedonia

The public broadcasting service MRT broadcasts programs in the languages of six ethnic communities (Albanian, Turkish, Romani, Aromanian (Vlach), Serbian and Bosnian) in the country via one TV and one FM radio station. Public TV programs in the languages of ethnic communities are broadcasted on the MRT 2 and public radio programs are broadcasted on the MR3.

Distribution of the TV programs in the languages of ethnic communities on the MRT 2 is listed below,

- *In Albanian: 9,5 hours daily*
- *In Turkish: 2,5 hours daily*
- *In Romani: 30 minutes three times per week (Tuesday, Thursday and Saturday) and 1 hour on every last Sunday of the month*
- *In Serbian: 30 minutes three times per week (Monday, Wednesday and Friday) and 1 hour on every last Sunday of the month*
- *In Aromanian: 30 minutes three times per week (Monday, Wednesday and Friday) and 1 hour on every last Sunday of the month*
- *In Bosnian: 30 minutes three times per week (Tuesday, Thursday and Saturday) and 1 hour on every last Sunday of the month*

Distribution of the radio programs in the languages of ethnic communities on the MR 3 is listed below,

- *In Albanian: 8,5 hours a day and 9 hours on Saturday and Sunday*
- *In Turkish: 5 hours daily*

- *In Romani: 30 minutes per day*
- *In Serbian: 30 minutes per day*
- *In Aromanian: 30 minutes per day*
- *In Bosnian: 30 minutes per day*

We should note that most of the members of non-majority communities in the country receive information in their own language mainly from the MRT 2 and MR 3 due to small numbers of private TV and radio stations in their languages on national or regional level. (See. Table 2 and Table 3) On the other hand, public non-majority-language programming is generally considered unattractive to viewers and of low quality, both technically and professionally. (Council of Europe, 2016) For example, there are only two employees in Romani service of the MRT and three employees in Aromanian service that indicates to poor potential to perform its function. The main conclusion on the public non-majority-language programming is that the MRT neglects its obligation to meet the information needs of non-majority communities, in which the ethnic communities' belong. (Mičevski, Trpevska & Trajkoska, 2013)

Private Broadcasting in the Non-majority languages in the Republic of North Macedonia

As of November 15th, 2018, there are total of 53 TV and 70 FM radio stations in private broadcasting sector in the Republic of North Macedonia. Among them, 20 TV and 14 FM radio stations broadcast in the languages of the ethnic communities and 6 TV and 3 FM radio stations broadcast in the languages of the non-majority communities. (See. Table 2 and Table 3) When we compare the number of private TV and FM radio stations in the languages of non-majority communities in 2013 with their number in 2018, the number of TV stations remain the same but the number of FM radio stations decreased from 5 to 3 in 5 years. (Tuneva, 2013; Агенција за аудио и аудиовизуелни медиумски услуги, 2018a; Агенција за аудио и аудиовизуелни медиумски услуги, 2018b)

Table 2. Private broadcasting companies that broadcast TV programs in the languages of non-majority communities. (Languages with bold font are the languages of non-majority communities)

Name of Broadcaster	Broadcast Level	Broadcast Language(s)	Area
TV Shenja	National	Macedonian, Albanian and Turkish	All cities of the Republic of Macedonia
TV Edo	Regional	Macedonian and Bosnian	Skopje
TV Era	Regional	Albanian and Turkish	Skopje
TV Šutel	Regional	Macedonian and Romani	Skopje
TV Globi	Local	Macedonian, Albanian and Turkish	Gostivar, Vrapčište and Bogovinje
TV Plus	Local	Macedonian and Serbian	Kumanovo, Lipkovo and Staro Nagoričane

Source: Retrieved from Агенција за аудио и аудиовизуелни медиумски услуги, (2018), “Регистар на радиодифузери што емитуваат телевизиска програма (ажуриран на 15.11.2018 година)” (2018a)

Table 3. Private broadcasting companies that broadcast radio programs in the languages of non-majority communities. (Languages with bold font are the languages of non-majority communities)

Name of Broadcaster	Broadcast Level	Broadcast Language(s)	Area
Radio Buba Mara	Regional	Macedonian and Serbian	Skopje
Radyo Balkan FM	Local	Macedonian, Albanian and Turkish	Gostivar
Radio Bum	Local	Macedonian and Serbian	Kumanovo

Source: Retrieved from Агенција за аудио и аудиовизуелни медиумски услуги, (2018), “Регистар на радиодифузери што емитуваат радио програма (ажурирано на 15.11.2018 година)” (2018b)

RIGHTS VS. REALITIES: ACCESS OF TURKISH COMMUNITY TO BROADCAST IN REPUBLIC OF NORTH MACEDONIA

According to the latest census in the Republic of North Macedonia in 2002, 77.959 citizens (which constitutes 3,9% of the total population in Republic of North Macedonia) declared they were ethnic-Turk (hereinafter referred to as Turks or as the community). (Државен завод за статистика на Република Македонија, 2005) As the largest non-majority community in the country, Turks live in many small or large populated places throughout the Republic of North Macedonia. The community is most represented in the capital region of Skopje with the population of 12.123 (2,1%), then in North-Western Municipality of Gostivar with the population of 7.991 (9,9%), in Western Municipality of Centar Župa Municipality with the population of 5.226 (80,2%), in Central Municipality of Plasnica with the population of 4.446 (97,8%), Eastern Municipality of Radoviš with the population of 4.061 (14,4%), South-Western Municipalities of Dolneni with the population of 2.597 (19.1%), and so on. Turkish language is official language in 10 municipalities out of 15 municipalities which have ethnic communities less than 20%. (See. Table 1) But there is no standard on the recognition of Turkish language in municipalities. For example Turkish Language is one of the official languages of Gostivar where Turks constitute 9,9% of the population but not in Karbinici where Turks constitute just over 18% of the population, according to latest census in 2002.

In the land of Republic of North Macedonia, Turkish language programming in the public broadcaster date back to the first days of the official foundation of Radio Skopje, subnational public radio station in the People's Republic of Macedonia, one of the constituent republics of the Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia. Turkish language radio programming started to broadcast in 1945, few days after the beginning of public radio

broadcast in Macedonian language and three years before the beginning of public radio broadcast in Albanian language in the country. Turkish language TV programming in the land of current republic started to broadcast in 1969 via RTV Skopje operated within JRT (Yugoslav Radio & Television). Turks, like all non-majority communities in the country, receive information in their own language mainly from the public broadcaster by the positive effect of its rooted background. As we mentioned above, Turks live in many places throughout the country. When we take account of the fact that the majority of Turks live in rural and/or small populated places and the other important fact that there is no nation-wide private terrestrial TV and radio broadcaster that has certain percentage of program in Turkish language, the community cannot enjoy its rights of access to media and cannot be informed in their language which would satisfy their needs that was ensured by Article 51 of the current Law on Broadcasting Activity. (Republic of Macedonia, 2005)

The third channel of public radio broadcaster MR 3 broadcasts 5 hours on daily basis, while the second channel of public TV broadcaster MRT 2 broadcasts about 2,5 hours in Turkish language on daily basis, in the period from 3:30pm to 6:00pm which covers short news from 5 to 10 minutes, more detailed news that last from 20 to 30 minutes and editorial programmes. When we compare the demographic indicators and distribution of the population of the community, it can be said that Turkish language coverage ratio of the public radio broadcaster ($5/24=20,8\%$) and public TV broadcaster ($2,5/24=10,4\%$) is higher than the percentage of the community in the total population of the country (3,86%). According to the rates above, it can be said that the equitable representation of Turks in the public broadcasting services has been properly implemented.

According to latest reports, there are 12 journalists at the editorial office which is the largest employed editorial office among non-majority broadcasting services at the public

broadcaster. (Tuneva, 2013) It is questionable whether the the human resources enable the quality of journalistic contents are oriented towards the civic topics, as argued by Mičevski et al. (Mičevski, Trpevska & Trajkoska, 2013) The lack of technical capacities and the inadequate distribution in the public broadcaster is also confirmed by the members of the community. Main complaint of community members related to these problems is unrelated covers of the public broadcaster that mainly focused on the activities of and debates in Parliament. It's observed by authors that most of Turkish language contents of public broadcaster are all about translation of contents in Macedonian and Albanian. The Article 124 of the Law on Broadcasting Activity that brings restrictive provisions on the effective and creative programmes in Macedonian language or languages of non-majority communities with the minimum percentages of shares of vocal music and programmes originally created in Macedonian language in the total broadcasting time. According to this article, the state broadcaster is obliged to provide each TV channels in a specific time period with at least 40% of programme originally created in Macedonian language or in the languages of the non-majority communities. (Republic of Macedonia, 2005) The first problem of this article of 13 year-old law is that there is no mention of Albanian language that is neither Macedonian language nor the language of a non-majority community which is less than 20%. Second problem is that the perceptions mentioned above was already prescribed in Article 74 of the same law which says at least 30% of programmes of state broadcaster should be originally created in Macedonian language or the languages of non-majority communities. (Republic of Macedonia, 2005) Third problem that is very important for the ultimate goal of the Republic of North Macedonia (membership of the EU), is that these obligations on the percentages of shares of languages in the public broadcasting is a violation of the EU's Audiovisual Media Services Directive, which

never mentions a language in relation to creation of the content of programmes. (Karamandi et al., 2013; European Parliament, 2010) These uncertainties create dilemmas instead of efficient programmes. Besides the negative perception on the public broadcaster among Turks, MRT 2 brought together the leaders of the all three ethnic Turkish political parties for the first time before the historic referendum took place on September 30, 2018 in North Macedonia, which was welcomed by almost all the members of community. We should note that, contrary to the concerns mentioned in the Fourth Opinion of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, the MRT appears to be de-politicised, especially with the new government which was formed in 2017 but there are still question marks on the editorial independence. (Council of Europe, 2016)

On the other hand, Only one national TV station called "TV Shenja" reported of broadcast in Turkish language besides Albanian and Macedonian and there is one regional TV station called "TV Era" reported of broadcast in Turkish language besides Albanian in capital region of Skopje where the largest number of Turks live. But we should note that the certain Turkish language coverage ratio of these stations are unknown while there is no private radio station on national or local level in Skopje that broadcasts in Turkish language in addition to the fact that there is also no local TV or radio station stations in Centar Župa and Plasnica where Turks constitute more than 80% of their populations. (See. Table 2 and Table 3)

In recent years, the increasing opportunities of access to Turkey-based Turkish-language media through the cable and satellite TV channels made Turkish media in Turkey the main and widespread information tool of Turks in the Republic of North Macedonia. We can say that the lack of satisfaction of cultural and socio-political needs of Turks in Turkish-language media of Republic of North Macedonia is compensated by the information

and news from Turkey-based Turkish media that meets the needs of its audiences.

CONCLUSION

In a democratic society that aims to protect the human rights of each individual and to treat each person with equal concern and respect regardless of their national or religious etc. affiliation, it is imperative that these issues are fully regulated by legal practices and be addressed in the public policies. Failure to achieve balance in the realization of human rights can lead to tensions between ethnic communities in multicultural societies. On the other hand, It is an indisputable fact that media can contribute to the development of the society and the unity of society. In Article 9 of the FCNM it is stated that "In the legal framework of sound radio and TV broadcasting, the state parties shall ensure, as far as possible, and taking into account the provisions of paragraph 1 (persons belonging to a national minority are not discriminated against in their access to the media), that persons belonging to national minorities are granted the possibility of creating and using their own media." The legal practices in the Republic of North Macedonia are not at the desired level, even in some matters against the European directives. Fourth Opinion of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities which is the latest report of the Council's country-specific monitoring work on the framework convention, stated that "minority-language programming in the country is generally considered unattractive to viewers and of low quality, both technically and professionally. Journalists who work at minority services of public broadcaster are often not sufficiently trained, share among themselves two cameras only, and operate on a very limited budget which does not allow them to cover several stories countrywide at the same time"

For Turks, the largest non-majority community under 20%, the community cannot enjoy its rights of access to media and cannot be

informed in their language which would satisfy their needs that was ensured by the related law, EU directives and provisions of international instruments due to reasons mentioned above. These problems deepen more for Turks because most of the members of the community in the country receive information in their own language mainly from public broadcaster. On the other hand, it can be said that the equitable representation of Turks in the public broadcasting services has been properly implemented. The absence of private radio and TV channels in Turkish language and increasing opportunities of access to made Turkey-based Turkish language media the main and widespread information tool of Turks in the Republic of North Macedonia in recent years. This can easier the import of politics from Turkey despite the fact that it's very helpful for preservation and protection of the cultural and national identity of Turks.

REFERENCES

- Агенцијата за остварување на правата на заедниците. (2017). *Анализа на правото на употреба на јазикот, право на информирање на свој јазик преку електронските и печатените медиуми и право на употреба на симболи на припадниците на заедниците кои се помалку од 20 % во Република Македонија*. Скопје.
- Агенција за аудио и аудиовизуелни медиумски услуги. (2018). *Регистар на радиодифузери што емитуваат телевизиска програма (ажуриран на 15.11.2018 година)*. Скопје.
- Агенција за аудио и аудиовизуелни медиумски услуги. (2018). *Регистар на радиодифузери што емитуваат радио програма (ажурирано на 15.11.2018 година)*. Скопје.
- Council of Europe. (2016). *Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, Fourth Opinion on "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia", adopted on 24 February 2016*, Strasbourg.
- Darbishire, E. (1999). Minorities and Media Freedom under International Law", *Roma Rights, Newsletter of the European Roma Rights Center*. 4, 60-68.
- Dragovic, A. (2000). Differentials of Fertility in the Republic of Macedonia (empirical research). *New Balkan Politics*. 2.
- Државен завод за статистика на Република Македонија. (2005). *Попис на населението, домаќинствата и становите во Република Македонија, 2002 книга XIII*. Скопје.
- European Parliament. (2010). *Directive 2010/13/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 10 March 2010*. Official Journal of the European Union, L 95/1, 15.4.2010.
- Gözübenli, A. S. (2016). A Comparative Study of the Politics of Census in the Pre- and Post- Conflict Environment: The Case of the Republic of Macedonia. in: *Papajorgji, E. (Ed.): Book of Proceedings of Fifth International Conference on: "Interdisciplinary Studies – Global Challenge 2016"*. Bialystok, Poland. 364-370.
- Gözübenli, A. S. & Tekeshanoska N. (2018). Europeanization of the Balkans vs. Balkanization of Europe: A Vision Limited by Realities. *UBT International Conference*. 390. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33107/ubt-ic.2018.390>
- Kalehsar, O. S. and Andarab, M. S. (2012). Popularity of Turkish Media and its Effect on Turkish Language Learning of Azerbaijani Minority in Iran. *Journal of Advanced Social Research*. 2(5), 252-259.
- Kalehsar, O. S. and Andarab, M. S. (2013). Representation of the Azerbaijani minority in Iran's media and significance of the Turkish media. *New Media & Mass Mass Communication*. 10, 63–69.
- Karamandi, L., Medarski, V., Zhuta, J. & Belicanec, R. (2013). *Analysis of the draft Law on Media and Audiovisual Media Services*. Skopje: Media Development Center.
- Loskovska G. (2017). Linguistic rights' regime in Macedonia—Challenges and /or constraints for effectiveness of Human Rights or Quid Pro Quo for a stable multi-ethnic democracy. in: *The Politics of Multilingualism conference 2017*. Available from: <http://www.multilingualism.humanities.uva.nl/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/Panel-8-Loskovska.pdf> (Accessed 7 November 2018)
- McGonagle, T. (2009). Representation of Minorities: Rights of Access", *Media and Human Rights*. 106-126.
- Mičevski, I., Trpevska, S. and Trajkoska Z. (2013). *Izvestuvanje od paralelni svetovi: Mediumite na zaednicite vo Makedonija (Reporting from Parallel Worlds: Media of the Minorities in Macedonia)*. Skopje: School of Journalism and Public Relations.
- Republic of Macedonia. (1991). *Constitution of Republic of Macedonia 1991*. Official Gazette, No.52/1992.
- Republic of Macedonia. (1997). *The Law on Broadcasting Activity*. Official Gazette, No.20/1997.

Republic of Macedonia. (2005). *The Law on Broadcasting Activity*. Official Gazette, No. 100/2005.

Republic of Macedonia. (2008). *The Law on Promotion and Protection of Members of Communities that are Less than 20% of the Population in Republic of Macedonia*. Official Gazette, No. 92/2008.

Tuneva, M. (2013). *Makedonya Cumhuriyeti'nde medya alanında etnik topluluklar hakkında bildirimler ve haklarının analizi*. Üsküp: Makedonya Cumhuriyeti Topluluklar Haklarının Gerçekleştirme Ajansı.